

LANE APPRAISALS, INC.

Real Estate Valuation Consultants

EDWARD J. FERRARONE, MAI
PAUL A. ALFIERI, MAI
KAREN COLIN - SAGARA
GREGORY FAUGHNAN, MAI
LORI COADY
JANE M. MOSS
JOSEPH P. SIMINSKY
MARY BETH STARAPOLI
THOMAS KEON

JOHN W. LANE, MAI (1907-1993)

178 MYRTLE BOULEVARD
LARCHMONT, NEW YORK 10538
914-834-1400

FAX 914-834-1380
lane.app@verizon.net

March 10, 2013

Hon. Chairwoman Norma Drummond and Members of the Zoning Board
Zoning Board of Appeals
Town of East Fishkill
330 Route 376
Town of Hopewell Junction, NY 12533

Re: Verizon Wireless/Homeland Towers application
23 Dartantra Drive
Hopewell Junction
East Fishkill, NY 12533

Dear Chairwoman Drummond and Members of the Zoning Board:

In accordance with the request of Verizon Wireless (“Verizon”) and Homeland Towers LLC (“Homeland”) and together known as the Applicants, (“Applicants”), I have inspected the above site and have completed an analysis of the potential impact of the proposed, public utility wireless telecommunications facility (“Facility”,) which is to be located at 23 Dartantra Drive, in Hopewell Junction (East Fishkill), NY (“Property”). The Applicants are requesting permission to erect the Facility at this property. This analysis is to be used in connection with the application for approval which is being presented to the appropriate municipal boards.

The Property is known and designated as Section 6558, Block 2, Lot 1550918 and Section 6559, Block 3, Lot 470010 on the Assessment Maps of East Fishkill, NY. The site is located in an “R-1 - Residential” zone which specially permits Wireless Transmission Facilities and requires a minimum lot size of one acre. This site has 16.13 acres and abuts the Taconic State Parkway. No changes in the lot size are contemplated. All required setbacks will be exceeded.

The proposed Facility will be located on an undeveloped portion of the property and will be more than 500' from the nearest, neighboring, residential structure. It will be accessed via a proposed, access driveway from Dartantra Drive.

The Facility will have a 150 foot high, monopole with panel antennae mounted on the pole. All coaxial cables will be run within the monopole. Additionally there will be one, 12' X 30, prefabricated equipment shelters with room reserved within the compound area for five, additional colocators in the future. Those colocators may use prefab shelters or outdoor equipment on steel or concrete pads. Also, there will be a 4' by 4,' Verizon Wireless Telco cabinet, a small transformer and space for additional future use by colocators. There will be two parking spaces provided and a turn around area. Both the proposed structures and the parking area will be sited on a gravel surface.

The pole and associated equipment will be behind a proposed, 6' high, chain link fence. The balance of the Facility will have plantings consisting of arborvitae which will supplement the existing, significant, mature vegetation on the site.

At the request of the Applicants, the subject property was inspected to consider the effect of the proposed Facility upon the value of the surrounding properties. In connection therewith, I have made use of an ongoing study of sales of homes within a close proximity of similar communications facilities in Westchester, Putnam and Rockland Counties. I offer the following comments regarding the locations and value trends noted in areas which have similar communications facilities. There are fifteen separate studies, in eight exhibits, covering various time periods ranging from 2000 to 2012.

In the Town of Somers, NY, we have been studying sales of condominium units near a cellular monopole since 2000. The monopole is 100' high and is located on the top of the West Hill in the Heritage Hills complex. We have recently conducted a new study of sales in the 2009 - 2010 time period. In both studies, the units with a view of the cellular tower sold for higher prices than those with no view.

In Harrison, NY we have been following the sales which are located close to a 100' monopole sited at the Harrison DPW property on Gleason Place since 2002.

We also have been following the sales history of properties in the neighborhood of the Donnybrook monopole just off Weaver Street in New Rochelle, NY. The monopole was installed in 1997 and is 110' high. This particular monopole supports numerous carrier's antennas. Sales in the 2000 - 2001 time period and a recent study covering 2009 - 2010, each reveal that homes in the same neighborhood with a view of the monopole have sold for higher prices than those without such a view.

In the Town of Stony Point, NY, there is a monopole located next to the Stony Point Police Department building. This monopole is approximately 130' in height. I have located five sales of homes with a direct view of the communications facility and five sales of similar, nearby homes which do not have such views. There are little, if any differences between the values of these homes. That study covered the years 2003 - 2006. A second study for the years 2007 - 2009 showed similar results.

In the Village Suffern, NY, there is a stealth flag monopole and antennae which are approximately 90' high, located at the Village Hall. I have located fourteen sales of homes within that immediate neighborhood, eight of which have views of the monopole and six of which have no such view. The prices paid for each home are comparable and no differential in values is indicated based upon this study which encompassed the 2003 - 2006 time period.

I have just completed a recent study covering 2007 - 2010 in this same monopole area. I have found three sales of properties with a view of the monopole and six sales in the same neighborhood which did not have such views. It is interesting to note that the highest price paid during that period, on a price per square foot, was for the home which had a view of the monopole.

In the Town of Orangetown, there is a telecommunications facility located on the Town Hall property located at the intersection of Orangeburg Road and Dutch Hill Road. During the period 2003 - 2005, I have found five sales of homes with direct views of the existing communications facility. Twelve other sales of nearby homes, but without a view of the facility, were also identified and compared to those with the view. The unit of measurement was the price per square foot of house size. These sales indicate that the homes with the view of the facility sold for an average price of \$250 per square foot, while those homes without the view sold for an average of \$207.

A second study in the same neighborhood during 2007, showed a sale with a view of the monopole selling at \$294 per square foot and four nearby homes without this view selling at an average price per square foot of \$256.

A recently completed, additional study for 2008 - 2010, covers 3 sales with views of the monopole and six sales of homes in the same neighborhood with out views. The price per square foot for the homes with views was \$254.57 while the average price for the six homes without views was \$231.15. While I would not say that a view of a communications facility increases the value of a home, one could reasonably conclude that, based on this specific study, the value of homes with such a view are certainly not negatively impacted.

There is a monopole located at the Spring Valley Hook and Ladder property in the Village of Spring Valley, NY, which is approximately 100' in height. In a 2004 - 2006 study, I located seven homes with a direct view of this faculty. These homes had an average sales price of \$188.96 per square foot. Six sales of similar, nearby homes which do not have such views were also identified with an average sales price of \$196.17. There are only minor differences between the value of the homes with and without the views of a monopole.

At some point in time in about 2007, a second monopole was erected in the same neighborhood at the Spring Valley DPW site on Harriet Tubman Way. I have just completed a 2007 - 2010 study which shows three sales with views of the monopoles and average prices of \$246.33 and five sales in the same neighborhood but without views. These sales have an average price of \$212.20.

Finally, I examined nearby home sales in the Putnam Lake area of the Town of Patterson, NY for the period of 2010 to 2012. There is a sale of a home at 7 Brandon Road which has a view of the communications tower located on the hill behind 25 Garland Road in Patterson. This home sold for \$219.54 per square foot. Four nearby homes, without a view of a monopole, sold during the same time frame for an average price of \$180.87.

I have completed more than a dozen other such studies in three additional, nearby counties in New York State. In every instance, the results have been consistent and similar. There is no diminution in the value of homes with a view of a telecommunications facility.

The sales which were utilized in this analysis are summarized on the eight, attached exhibits. All of these studies involved communication monopoles or towers, and in no instance did I find that views of such communication facilities had any detrimental effect on property values. There was a normal range of value with typical increases or decreases in value according to the market for homes regardless of whether or not they had views of communications facilities.

As a result of this analysis, it is my expert opinion that the installation, presence, and/or operation of the proposed Facility will not result in the diminution of property values or reduce the marketability of properties in the immediate area. If you have any questions, please contact me.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "E. J. Ferrarone". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first letters of the first and last names being capitalized and prominent.

Edward J. Ferrarone, MAI
President

Exhibit 1, Somers, NY, NY

A 100' monopole located at the top of the West Hill in the Heritage Hills Condominium complex Somers , NY. The following sales have a view of the communications tower:

2000 STUDY

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
----------------	--------------------	------------------	--------------------	-----------------

This property has a direct view of the cellular tower.

352F Heritage Hills	\$260,000	3-01-2000	1,484	\$175
---------------------	-----------	-----------	-------	-------

The following property is in the same neighborhood but has no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
----------------	--------------------	------------------	--------------------	-----------------

357A Heritage Hills	\$245,500	7-13-2000	1,428	\$172
---------------------	-----------	-----------	-------	-------

Study indicates no price differential between properties with and without a view of a communications tower.

2009 - 2010 STUDY

These properties have a direct view of the cellular tower.

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
----------------	--------------------	------------------	--------------------	-----------------

351D Heritage Hills	\$350,000	8-12-2010	1,484	\$235.85
348B Heritage Hills	\$350,000	8-30-2010	1,428	\$245.09

Average sales price for unit with view of tower: \$240.47

The following property is in the same neighborhood but has no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
----------------	--------------------	------------------	--------------------	-----------------

362E Heritage Hills	\$330,000	5-31-2009	1,484	\$222.37
358D Heritage Hills	\$351,000	9-21-2009	1,550	\$226.45

Average sales price for unit without a view of tower: \$224.41

Study indicates slightly higher prices on homes with view of cellular tower.

Exhibit 2, Harrison, NY

A 10' monopole located in the Harrison DPW garage complex on Gleason Place in Harrison, NY. The following sales have a view of the communications tower:

2000 - 2002 STUDY

These properties have a view of the cellular tower.

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
18 Irving Place	\$300,500	9-14-2000	1,400	\$214
4 West End Place	\$355,000	10-03-2000	1,700	\$208
50 Park Ave	\$390,000	3-09-2002	1,254	\$311
68 Park Ave	\$472,500	8-15-2002	1,718	\$275
15 Brookside Lane	\$529,000	1-18-2002	1,568	\$333

Average sales price for homes with a view: \$268.20

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
33 Bentay Drive	\$440,000	8-03-2001	1,650	\$266
22 Bentay Drive	\$358,800	1-13-2000	1,600	\$224
33 Bellain Drive	\$450,000	8-09-2000	1,800	\$250
54 Oakland Ave	\$460,000	6-20-2002	1,700	\$270
12 Avondale Road	\$612,000	12-30-2002	2,450	\$249
14 Beaver Landing	\$625,000	6-13-2001	2,500	\$250

Average sales price for homes with view of cellular tower \$251.50

Study indicates higher prices for homes with a view of a communications tower. Also, highest prices paid per square foot were for homes with a view of the tower.

2009 - 2010 STUDY

Attempted to complete a new search of homes in the same neighborhood for the 2009 - 2010 time period. Due to the slow down in the real estate market, found that there were not enough sales to make such a study in this location.

Exhibit 3, New Rochelle, NY, NY

A 10' monopole located next to the Donnybrook Shopping Center on Weaver Street in New Rochelle, NY. This is a 110' monopole with multiple carries antennas mounted on it.

2000 - 2002 STUDY

These properties have a view of the cellular tower.

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
40 Alden Court	\$327,500	1-03-2000	1,600	\$204
1365 Weaver St	\$312,000	10-05-2001	1,300	\$240
27 Livingston Road	\$417,000	11-05-2001	1,800	\$231
67 Livingston Road	\$559,000	11-30-2002	2,152	\$259
15 Alden Court	\$490,000	7-10-2002	1,800	\$272
12 Livingston Road	\$670,000	8-02-2002	2,100	\$319
1369 Weaver St	\$333,000	1-09-2003	1,300	\$256

Average sales price for homes with a view: \$254.42

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
69 Daisy Farms Rd	\$325,000	7-24-200	1,500	\$216
129 Plymouth Drive	\$510,000	7-25-2000	2,007	\$254
973 Weaver Street	\$600,000	7-13-2000	2,800	\$214
15 Puritan Drive	\$480,000	8-29-2000	2,368	\$202
21 Plymouth Drive	\$455,000	8-29-2000	1,864	\$244
191 Plymoutn Drive	\$417,000	9-06-2000	2,200	\$189
141 Plymouth Drive	\$475,000	12-14-2000	2,000	\$237
53 Gladstone Road	\$349,000	2-05-2001	1,500	\$232
3 Greentree Drive	\$435,000	3-29-2001	2,400	\$181
174 Plymouth Drive	\$442,000	7-25-2001	1,502	\$294
66 Gladstone Road	\$615,000	8-06-2001	2,236	\$196
58 Puritan Drive	\$615,000	10-10-2001	3,500	\$175
37 Greentree Drive	\$457,000	11-05-2001	2,200	\$207
57 Plymouth Drive	\$443,000	1-31-2002	1,430	\$309
24 Gladstone Road	\$500,000	7-23-2002	1,758	\$287
12 Livingston Road	\$670,000	7-12-2002	2,100	\$319

Average sales price for homes with view of cellular tower \$234.75
Study indicates higher prices for homes a with a view of a communications tower.

2009 - 2010 STUDY

These properties have a view of the cellular tower.

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
15 Alden Court	\$549,500	6-19-2009	1,956	\$343
4 Shepherds Drive	\$530,000	8-25-2009	1,956	\$271
37 Greentree Drive	\$570,000	10-20-2009	2,200	\$283
30 Livingston Road	\$715,000	8-02-2010	2,100	\$340

Average sales price for homes with a view: \$309.25

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
53 Gladstone Road	\$715,000	2-10-2009	2,500	\$286
141 Plymouth Drive	\$637,500	9-14-2009	2,000	\$319
2 Livingston Road	\$560,000	12-17-2009	1,956	\$286
46 Greentree Drive	\$645,000	3-22-0210	2,277	\$283
63 Gladstone Road	\$508,000	8-30-2010	1,626	\$312

Average sales price for homes without view of cellular tower \$297.20

Study indicates higher prices for homes a with a view of a communications tower.

Exhibit 4, Stony Point, NY

A 130' monopole located at the Stony Point Police Department on Route 210, in Stony Point, NY. The following sales are located in the surrounding streets and are very close to the communications tower:

2003 - 2006 STUDY

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
24 Route 210	\$262,000	12-22-2003	1,092	\$239.92
26 Route 210	\$322,000	6-30-2005	1,092	\$294.87
44 Ten Eyck Street	\$397,000	4-16-2006	1,395	\$284.58
8 Hannigan Drive	\$445,000	8-26-2004	1,978	\$224.98
12 Central Avenue	\$328,000	1-28-2005	937	\$350.05
8 Florus Crom Ct	\$494,000	4-21-2005	2,167	\$227.97

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$270.40

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
173 Route 210	\$356,000	8-5-2004	1,312	\$271.34
225 Route 210	\$301,000	11-25-2003	1,666	\$180.67
12 Pyngyp Road	\$798,000	9-10-2004	3,267	\$244.26
109 Thiells Road	\$389,900	11-9-2005	1,292	\$301.78
6 Jenkins Ave	\$400,000	3-13-2006	1,178	\$339.56

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$267.52

Study indicates no price differential between properties with and without a view of a communications tower.

2007 - 2009 STUDY - Stony Point

Homes with Direct View of Tower

Smaller Homes

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
11 Sunrise Drive	\$435,000	6-29-2007	1,748	\$248.85
122 Route 210	\$345,270	11-24-2008	1,228	\$281.16
Average Sales Price per Square Foot:				\$265.00

Larger Home

3 FIFlorus Crom Ct	\$595,000	10-15-2007	2,737	217.39
--------------------	-----------	------------	-------	--------

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
<u>Smaller Homes</u>				
35 Sunrise Drive	\$445,000	4-18-2007	1,824	\$243.96
9 Wenzel Lane	\$415,000	8-22-2007	1,872	\$221.68
14 Garrison Lane	\$389,000	4-24-2009	1,896	\$205.16
Average Sales Price per Square Foot:				\$223.60

Larger Homes

156 Route 210	\$475,000	3-21-2007	2,110	\$225.11
17 Brooks Dr	\$370,000	11-26-2008	2,286	\$161.85
8 Garrison Lane	\$415,000	7-17-2008	2,104	\$197.24
11 Schassler Pl	\$465,000	2-19-2009	2,853	\$162.98
3 Garrison Lane	\$389,000	4-20-2009	2,166	\$179.59
Average Sales Price per Square Foot				\$185.35

Study indicates no price reduction for homes with a view of a communications tower. There have been very few recent sales in this area making it impossible to update to 2010.

Exhibit 5, Suffern, NY

A stealth flagpole was constructed at 61 Washington Avenue and consists of a monopole/flagpole at the Suffern Village Hall. It is approximately 90' in height. The following sales have a direct view of the communications tower:

2004 - 2006 Study

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
20 Clinton Place	\$435,000	3-3-2006	1,888	\$230.40
37 W Maple Avenue	\$385,000	1-12-2005	1,892	\$203.49
17 Mansfield Place	\$460,000	8-8-2005	1,826	\$251.92
44 Park Avenue	\$585,100	1-31-2006	2,600	\$225.04
50 Park Avenue	\$330,000	4-30-2004	2,090	\$157.89
54 Park Avenue	\$475,000	6-27-2005	2,368	\$200.59
39 W Maltbie Ave	\$300,000	4-1-2004	884	\$339.37
52 E Maltbie Ave	\$459,000	7-19-2004	2,179	\$210.65

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$220.78

These properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
74 E Maple Ave	\$537,500	3-10-2006	1,994	\$269.56
25 Ramapo Ave	\$540,000	1-14-2006	2,826	\$191.08
153 Lafayette Ave	\$378,260	11-2-2005	1,931	\$195.81
8 Riverside Drive	\$320,000	3-10-2006	1,314	\$243.53
22 Antrim Ave	\$290,000	11-24-2003	1,540	\$188.31

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$217.67

Study indicates no price differential between properties with and without a view of a communications tower.

2007 - 2010 Study - Suffern

The following sales have a direct view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
23 Clinton Pl	\$520,000	8-09-2007	2,611	\$199.15
17 Mansfield Pl	\$420,000	2-28-2008	1,826	\$230.01
54 E. Maltbie St	\$375,000	6-14-2007	1,306	\$287.13

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$238.76

These properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sales Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
6 Cross St	\$300,000	8-10-2007	1,176	\$255.10
11 Riverside Dr	\$365,000	6-28-2007	1,709	\$213.57
169 Wayne Av	\$347,000	1-04-2008	1,482	\$234.14
143 Wayne Av	\$351,000	1-09-2008	1,458	\$240.74
48 Park Av	\$310,000	8-18-2008	2,269	\$136.62
7 Maple Ave	\$317,000	11-12-2009	1,400	\$226.42

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$217.76

The study indicates lower prices without a view of a communications tower. It is interesting to note that the highest price per square foot was paid for a house with a view of a tower. No usable sales in 2010.

Exhibit 6, Orangeburg, NY

A monopole located at the Orangeburg Town Hall on Orangeburg Road. The following sales are located in the surrounding streets and have a direct view of the communications tower:

2003 - 2005 Study

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
59 Dutch Hollow Drive	\$437,000	12-23-2003	1,840	\$237.50
86 Dutch Hollow Drive	\$330,000	9-12-2003	1,504	\$219.41
7 Devon Drive	\$410,000	10-30-2003	2,004	\$204.59
222 Devon Drive	\$385,000	1-9-2004	1,272	\$302.67
135 S Parkway Drive	\$529,900	10-20-2005	1,840	\$287.99
	Average Sales Price per Square Foot:			\$250.43

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
51 W Orangeburg Road	\$404,000	12-22-2004	1,780	\$226.97
55 W Orangeburg Road	\$406,500	6-7-2005	1,604	\$253.43
273 Blaisdell Road	\$375,000	1-6-2005	1,816	\$206.50
275 Blaisdell Road	\$537,000	8-15-2005	2,028	\$264.79
295 Bunker Hill Road	\$661,000	12-16-2005	2,594	\$254.82
238 Betsy Ross Drive	\$492,500	9-1-2005	1,816	\$271.92
10 Dutchess Drive	\$500,000	7-16-2004	2,384	\$209.73
37 Dutchess Drive	\$735,000	8-12-2005	3,024	\$243.06
2 Dutch Hollow Drive	\$360,000	12-17-2004	1,504	\$239.36
40 Carlton Road	\$387,500	12-9-2004	1,992	\$194.53
27 Dutchess Drive	\$735,000	1-10-2005	3,353	\$222.19
32 Dutchess Drive	\$785,000	9-21-2005	2,816	\$278.76
	Average Sales Price per Square Foot:			\$207.15

Study indicates no loss of value for properties with a view of a communications tower.

2007 Study - Orangeburg, NY

This is the only sale during this time period with a direct view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
123 Parkway Dr South	\$350,000	12-28-2007	1,190	\$294.11

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
30 Parkway Dr South	\$430,000	10-26-2007	1,504	\$285.90
35 Chestnut Oval	\$520,000	11-09-2007	1,840	\$282.60
26 Carleton Rd	\$400,000	11-18-2007	1,960	\$204.08
103 Parkway Dr South	\$400,000	11-20-2007	1,596	\$250.62
Average Sales Price per Square Foot:				\$255.87

Study indicates no loss of value for properties with a view of a communications tower.

2008 - 2010 Study - Orangeburg, NY

These are sales during this time period with a direct view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
50 Dutch Hollow Dr	\$465,000	8-22-2008	1,900	\$244.73
66 Dutch Hollow Dr	\$568,000	7-13-2009	2,300	\$246.96
116 Parkway Dr S	\$420,000	10-13-2009	1,544	\$272.02
Average Sales Price				\$254.57

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
14 Parkway Dr S	\$430,000	1-31-2008	1,840	\$233.69
2 Fern Oval W	\$411,000	5-22-2009	1,874	\$219.31
1 Edgewood Dr	\$510,000	9-22-2009	2,400	\$212.50
39 Carleton Rd	\$463,000	10-15-2009	1,840	\$251.63
43 Carleton Rd	\$435,000	10-20-2009	1,840	\$236.41
34 Chestnut Oval	\$351,000	3-02-2010	1,504	\$233.37
Average Sales Price per Square Foot:				\$231.15

Study indicates no loss of value for properties with a view of a communications tower.

Exhibit 7 Spring Valley , NY

A monopole located at the Spring Valley Hook and Ladder building on Furman Place. The following sales are located in the surrounding streets and have a direct view of the communications tower:

2004 - 2006 Study

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
12 Chestnut Street	\$396,000	12-6-2005	1,980	\$200.00
21 Chestnut Street	\$600,000	10-3-2005	4,131	\$145.24
15 Walnut Place	\$200,000	8-11-2004	1,862	\$228.83
17 Walnut Place	\$350,000	11-21-2005	1,761	\$198.75
18 Lawrence Street	\$429,000	8-15-2005	2,324	\$184.60
20 Van Orden Avenue	\$494,000	8-17-2005	2,586	\$191.03
9-11 Van Orden Avenue	\$318,500	8-17-2004	2,080	\$153.12

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$188.96

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
43 Commerce Street	\$282,500	8-13-2004	1,260	\$224.21
9 Ann Street	\$310,000	1-21-2005	1,350	\$229.63
48 S Madison Avenue	\$410,000	9-22-2004	3,206	\$127.89
N Cole Avenue	\$295,000	2-26-2004	1,513	\$194.98
57 Decatur Avenue	\$650,000	10-27-2005	3,188	\$203.89
33 Columbus Avenue	\$385,000	2-21-2006	1,960	\$196.43

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$196.17

Study indicates roughly equal value for properties with and without a view of a communications tower.

2007 - 2010 Study

After second monopole erected at DPW site in same neighborhood.

The following sales are located in the surrounding streets and have a direct view of the communications towers:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
6 Cole Ave N	\$433,160	6-15-2007	2,086	\$207.65
26 Cole Ave S	\$350,000	12-10-2007	1,476	\$237.12
5 Collins St	\$250,000	3-22-2010	849	\$294.46

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$246.41

The following properties are in the same neighborhood but have no view of the communications towers:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
48 West St	\$365,000	1-04-2007	1,500	\$243.33
7 Van Orden Ave	\$453,200	3-13-2007	1,872	\$242.09
51 Collins St	\$145,500	4-26-2010	960	\$151.56
18 Van Orden Ave	\$196,000	6-10-2010	1,092	\$179.48
50 Collins St	\$160,000	6-24-2010	650	\$246.15

Average Sales Price per Square Foot: \$212.52

Study indicates lower values for homes without a view of a communications tower.

Exhibit 8, Putnam Lake area of Patterson, NY

A monopole located on the hillside behind 25 Garland Road in Patterson, NY. The following sale are located several streets away and has a direct view of the communications tower:

2010 - 2012 Study

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
7 Brandon Road	\$173,000	3-29-2010	778	\$219.58

The following properties are in the same Putnam Lake neighborhood but have no view of the communications tower:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Living Area</u>	<u>Price/SF</u>
1 Allen Drive	\$252,500	2-1-2010	920	\$274.46
111 Haviland Drive	\$160,000	10-0-2010	1,048	\$152.67
18 Ottawa Road	\$150,000	2-24-2011	768	\$195.31
50 Homer Drive	\$190,000	3-4-2011	1,880	\$101.06

Average price per square foot: 180.87